Debriefing in a Simulation Environment

“Guided learning through practical experience”
Objectives

1. Define debriefing
2. List three phases of debriefing
3. Describe the structure of an effective debriefing
4. Discuss the importance of discovering "frames"
5. Demonstrate the Advocacy-Inquiry method
6. Describe the DASH debriefing assessment model
What is Debriefing?

CMS’s working definition

“A conversation between two or more people to review a real or simulation event in which participants analyze their actions and reflect on the role of thought processes, psychomotor skills, and emotional states to improve or sustain performance in the future”
What is Debriefing?

- **Definitions/terms**
  - A post-simulation session designed to promote reflective learning typically conducted
  - Immediately after the simulation session and focused on specific participant performance or behavior

- **Key questions:**
  - Why is debriefing important? Is debriefing different than feedback? Is a ‘safe environment’ important and why? What is the right dose? Is videotape always necessary?
Debriefing Pro’s

1. Thoughtful discussion after the simulation is important to allow the learner to sort out events, interpret what happened and why.

2. Adults may learn better through self-discovery and self-analysis than by lecture.

3. Realizing that they will be called upon to work with their knowledge, students may come to class more prepared.

4. If they discover what they need to work on by themselves, then they are much more likely to.
Debriefing Cons

1. Slower than lecture = less efficient on the surface

2. Requires faculty training and orientation

3. Not all material is suited to be simulated

4. Some trainees do not appreciate the scrutiny
Model of Emotion

- Stressed
- Un-pleasant
- Bored
- Relaxed
- Activated
- Excited
- Pleasant
- In-activated

Crisis Simulation

Safe/ Effective Debriefing Area

Debriefing

Morris, D. SimTec 2008
Structured and supported debriefing

Definition of ‘structured and supported’
- **Structured** elements include three specific debriefing phrases with related goals, actions, and time estimates
- **Supported** elements include both interpersonal support as well as use of protocols, algorithms, and best evidence to inform debriefing statements/questions

Other considerations
- Simple, can be learned rapidly, scalable, validated by practice
Student focused...

- A learner-centric process designed to standardize the instructor/student post-event interaction to assist learners in thinking about **what** they did, **when** they did it, **how** they did it, **why** they did it and **how** they can improve
Active listening

Be aware of your own views, feelings, and opinions.

Use non-verbal communication

Use verbal communication
  – Interject
  – Restate
  – Expand
Debriefing Training Goals

- Become familiar with:
  - Structure of effective debriefing
  - Evidence base and theories of debriefing
  - Importance of discovering learner “frames”
    - Seeing through the learner’s mind’s eye
  - Advocacy plus Inquiry
Experiential Learning

- Real Event / Simulation
  (Concrete Experience)
- Changed Behavior
  (Active Experimentation)
- Debriefing
  (Reflective Observation)
- What Was Learned
  Abstract Conceptualization
- What Will Be Done Differently
  (Planning for Implementation)

Adapted from Kolb Learning Style Inventory
Reflective Practice

Frames -> Actions

Debriefing leads to new frames

Debriefing changes later actions

Actions -> Results
‘This isn’t as alien as you think’
Judgmental approach to debriefing

- **My goals as a debriefer**
  - Get you to do the right thing: avoid the wrong thing (as defined by me)
  - Occasionally, shame you, make you feel bad

- **My frames as a debriefer**
  - I know what went wrong: “I have the answer”
  - I have to get you to see it my way
  - If I have to shame or blame you into it, it’s

- **How I do this**
  - Uses a blaming or sarcastic tone
  - States the judgment and (often) solution
“Non-Judgmental” Approach

- **My goals as a debriefer**
  - Avoid shame and blame; “people make mistakes”
  - I want to maintain a good relationship with you
  - Get you to do the right thing; avoid the working this (as defined by me)

- **My frames as a debriefer**
  - I know what went wrong; “I have the answer”
    - **BUT** I don’t want you to be defensive
    - **BUT** I think it’s better if you find the answer yourself

- **How I do this**
  - I withhold the judgment
  - I try to gently lead the learner to what I think but won’t say
Debriefing with Good Judgment

**My goals as a debriefer**
- Establish a context for learning and change
- Strengthen our ability to talk about difficult topics
- Provide information, motivation, and applications

**My frames as a debriefer; my stance**
- Adult learners will change when they choose!
- Curiosity about the learner + willingness to test my assumptions
Debriefing with Good Judgment

To help improve or sustain performance…

DOES share observations, opinions, judgments based on expertise
DOES use curiosity and respect to explore the basis of performance
DOES **NOT** assume a stance of certainty and righteousness
The Art of Exploring: Advocacy + Inquiry

Advocacy: My perspective
- Use “First person” voice
- Make my perspective clear
  - I observed_____
  - I am concerned/please because_____
    (Here I state my perspective; why this matters)

Inquiry:
- Short, open-ended quests
  - I wonder what happened?
  - I’m curious how you see it?
  - What was on your mind at the time?
  - I wonder why? to find the learner’s perspective

Advocacy plus Inquiry: Examples

- **Observation + Inquiry**
  - “Watching that resuscitation, I wasn’t sure who was in charge. How did you all experience it?”

- **Observation, point of view, Inquiry**
  - “Eduardo, I now understand you were considering asthma in your differential. But I didn’t hear you say that explicitly during the case and I think that may have delayed treatment — “
    - “I’m wondering how you see it?”
    - “I wonder what others were thinking at the time?”
Advocacy plus Inquiry...your turn to practice
Clean up the “dirty questions”

“Dirty” Question

Did you feel like you and the other team handled sharing the defibrillator as well as you might have?

Do you think that short time frame was enough?

Did it occur to you to call for help?

Why wouldn’t you double check?

How do you think that went?

Clean Advocacy plus Inquiry
‘Don’t be a monster’
Debriefing Model – G.A.S.

Developed by the American Heart Association (with modifications from Harvard and KP)
Three Phases of Debriefing

- **Gather** – Clear the air and set the stage for discussion
  - Feelings
  - Facts

- **Analyze** – Analyze and apply
  - Exploring – explore trainee’s perspective on scenarios events
  - Discussion and teaching – help move trainees to new perspectives, understandings, and skills
  - Generalize and apply – lessons learned to real settings

- **Summarize** – Distill lessons learned for future use
  - “Take away”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Goal</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Possible Scripts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gather</td>
<td>(1) Listen to participants to understand how they feel</td>
<td>■ Elicit participants emotional state</td>
<td>To All: How do you feel?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(2) Identify what happened during the scenario</td>
<td>■ Request narrative from team leader</td>
<td>To Team Leader: Can you tell us what happened?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Request clarifying or supplemental information form team</td>
<td>To Team members: Can you add to the account?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyze</td>
<td>(1) Assure continuous focus on session objectives</td>
<td>■ Review of accurate record of events</td>
<td>■ I noticed…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Direct/redirect participants to assure continuous focus on session objectives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Using Advocacy/Inquiry:</td>
<td>■ Tell me more about…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(2) Facilitate participant’s reflection on &amp; analysis of their</td>
<td>■ Report observations (correct/incorrect steps)</td>
<td>■ How did you feel about…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>individual actions</td>
<td>■ Ask a series of questions to reveal participants’ thinking processes</td>
<td>■ What were you thinking when…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Assist participant to reflect on their performance</td>
<td>■ I understand, however, tell me about “X” aspect of the scenario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Using Plus/Delta:</td>
<td>■ Let’s refocus – “What’s important is not how it’s right but what is right for the patient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(3) Facilitate team’s reflection on &amp; analysis of systems issues</td>
<td>■ Identify systems/team issues: to reinforce the ‘+’ and consider action on the ‘Δ’</td>
<td>■ What systems/teamwork aspects went well?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summarize</td>
<td>Facilitate identification &amp; review of lessons learned</td>
<td>■ Summary of comments or statements</td>
<td>■ What systems/teamwork aspects need improvement?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Looking at our original objectives, what have we learned?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>■ What will you do differently based on this experience?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
G.A.S. in Action
Back to the ‘Monsters’
DASH assessment model

- Developed by Harvard
  - Needs validation
  - Student version
- Tool designed to guide assessment of debriefings
  - For evaluating and developing debriefing skills
DASH Assessment Model: 6 Elements

1. Sets the stage for engaging learning environment
2. Maintains an engaging context for learning
3. Structures debriefing in an organized way
4. Provokes interesting and engaging discussions & fosters reflective practice
5. Identifies performance gaps
6. Helps close performance gaps
Summary Points

- Impossible to debrief everything
- Debriefing should be learner-centric and conducted within a safe environment
- Participants need and value the feedback
- Debriefing points are derived through setting appropriate session/course objectives
- Tools should be created and used
  - video, SimMan log, checklist
- Instructor skills - active listening, probing, stimulating reflection
Debriefing Practice